

# Disclosure of Confidential Medical Record of The Patient of Corona Virus Disease 2019

Mokhamad Khoirul Huda<sup>1</sup>, Yulianto<sup>2</sup>, Ninis Nugraheni<sup>2</sup>, Yoan Nursari Simanjuntak<sup>3</sup>, Sadjijono<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Professor, <sup>2</sup>Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, Hang Tuah University, Surabaya, Indonesia, <sup>3</sup>Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Surabaya, Indonesia, <sup>4</sup>Professor, Faculty of Law, Bhayangkara Surabaya of University, Indonesia

## Abstract

This study aimed to find out the disclosure of confidential medical record of Covid-19 patients from legal norms, ethics and medical disciplines in Indonesia. This research used normative juridical methods which had a pre-descriptive characteristic. This research found the disclosure of confidential medical record of the Covid-2019 patients can be opened for the benefit of the patient's health, fulfilling the demands of law enforcement officials in the context of law enforcement, the patient's own request, or based on statutory provisions. This research is very useful for the community, hospitals, educational institutions and the government to provide legal protection to society to not be exposed by Covid-2019. The disclosure of confidential medical record of Covid-19 patients is permitted in relation to the patient's initials, gender, place of residence, age and health status.

**Keywords:** Confidential Medical Record, Pandemic of Covid-19, Community Interests; Patient; Doctor; Medical Ethics and Discipline.

## Introduction

On March 11, 2020, the World Health Organization declared the Corona Virus Disease 2019 (Covid-19) as a pandemic.<sup>1,2</sup> The Covid-19 pandemic spread to Indonesia, said by President Joko Widodo on Monday, March 2, 2020.<sup>3</sup> Two Indonesian citizens residing in Depok were found to be positive with Covid-19 after having a history of interacting with Japanese citizens who were known to suffer from this disease.<sup>4</sup> This incident, later, made the Government of Indonesia issued Presidential Decree No. 11 of 2020 concerning Determination of Corona Virus Disease (Covid-19) on Public Health Emergency and Presidential Decree No. 12 of 2020 concerning Determination of Non-Natural Disaster of Corona Virus Disease 2019 as a National Disaster.<sup>5</sup>

The spread of Covid-19 in Indonesia is now increasingly widespread in almost all districts and provinces. The number of cases and / or the number of deaths is increasing. This situation impacts on the political, economic, social, cultural, defense, security and welfare aspects of the Indonesian people.<sup>6</sup> The spread of Covid-19 on July 8, 2020 showed the number of positive confirmation cases numbered 68,079 people, 3,359 patients died and 31,585 patients recovered.<sup>7</sup>

Data of Covid-19 patient was stored in medical records and kept by doctors and health services.<sup>8</sup> Medical record is very important and is closely attached to the activities of medical services and health services.<sup>9</sup> Some even say that the medical record can be considered as the third person when the doctor received his patient.<sup>10</sup> Medical records are very useful for both doctors and patients.<sup>11</sup> This medical record showed the doctor of the patient's condition at the time of illness, examination and treatment the patient had received so that the doctor can take right treatments when the patient come for the treatment.<sup>12</sup> The doctor was bound by the patient's medical record to be kept confidentially.<sup>13, 14</sup> Disclosure

---

### Corresponding author:

**Dr. Mokhamad Khoirul Huda**

Professor, Insurance Law, Universitas Hang Tuah Indonesia. Contact: Tel.+6281357437000;  
E mail – emka.huda@hangtuah.ac.id

of the patient's medical record by a doctor can have the effect of violating the law, ethics and discipline.<sup>15</sup> In the pandemic of Covid-19, whether the doctor is still bounded by the confidentiality of the patient's medical record, considering the confidentiality of the Covid-19 medical record can affect to a very rapid and massive impact on transmission to society.<sup>16</sup>

## Discussion

### Doctor

Doctors are a major component in health services to the community.<sup>17</sup> The role of doctors is very important because it is directly related to improving the degree of public health. Article 1 number 2 of the Medical Practice Law limits the term of doctor as doctors, specialists, dentists, and dental specialists who have graduated from medical or dental education both domestically and abroad recognized by the Government of the Republic of Indonesia in accordance with statutory regulations.<sup>18</sup>

The doctor is a health worker who is the patient's first contact in resolving all health problems faced beyond considering of the type of disease, organology, age group, gender, as early as possible to provide the best health services to patients.<sup>19</sup> A doctor has main competencies including: effective communication skills, basic clinical skills, skills in applying the basics of biomedical science, clinical science, behavioral science and epidemiology in medical practice, skills in processing health problems in individuals, families or communities in a comprehensive and holistic way, continuous, coordinated and collaborated in the context of primary health care, utilizing critical assessments and managing information, introspective, self-development, lifelong learning, upholding moral ethics and professionalism in practice.<sup>20</sup>

Besides, doctors have some obligations; general obligations, obligations to themselves, obligations to colleagues and obligations to patients. Specially for the obligations to patients, it include: being sincere in using all their knowledge and skills for the benefit of patients, providing opportunities for patients to always be in touch with their family and counselors and must keep everything that they know about a patient, even after the patient's death and perform emergency relief as a humanitarian task.<sup>21</sup>

### Patient

Patients are people who consult their health problems to obtain the necessary health services either directly or indirectly to the doctor or dentist. Patients in receiving health services to doctors have the right to get a full explanation of medical measures, ask the opinion of a doctor or other dentist, get services according to medical needs, refuse medical treatment, and to obtain the contents of the medical record.<sup>22</sup>

The patient's obligations to the doctor in health services were providing complete and honest information about his health problems, obeying doctor's or dentist's advice and instructions and complying with the applicable provisions in health care facilities, and providing compensation for services received.<sup>23</sup>

Based on the rights and obligations of the patient, the legal relationship between the patient and the doctor in health services will bring legal impact.<sup>24</sup> The impact of this law can be regarding the legal responsibilities of doctors to patients in case of violations of law, ethics and discipline.<sup>25</sup>

### Medical Records

To realize the optimal health status for the whole community, it is necessary to improve the quality of health services or medical practices accompanied by adequate supporting facilities in health services, one of which is the implementation of medical records in the form of examinations, treatment and care.<sup>26, 27</sup>

The implementation of medical practice services required a doctor to refer to applicable standards, guidelines and procedures so public receives medical services in a professional and safe manner.<sup>28</sup> The patient's trust to the doctor resulted to the doctor's obligation to keep everything he knew.<sup>29</sup>

The Medical Practice Act regulates the medical record in Article 46 paragraph (1) every doctor or dentist in carrying out medical practice is required to make a medical record. Medical records must be written, complete and clear or electronically.<sup>30</sup>

Medical records are files contain records and documents about patient identity, examinations, treatment, actions, and other services given to patients,

and regulated in Minister of Health Regulation No.269 / MENKES / PER / III / 2008 concerning on Medical Records.<sup>31</sup>

While the benefits of medical record, it can be useful for treatment to the patient, improving the quality of services, education and research, financing, health statistics and proving legal issues, disciplinary and ethical issues.<sup>32</sup>

### **Privacy Rights of Patients in Health Services.**

The concept of state law placed the idea of protecting human rights as an important element of country life. By considering the urgency of protecting these human rights, the constitution must contain human rights arrangements to provide a guarantee to all citizens.<sup>33</sup>

Human rights are universally recognized values. Amendments to the 1945 Constitution had included guarantees of the protection and fulfillment of the human rights of citizens in the constitution. Some Articles in the 1945 Amendment regulated comprehensively about the human rights of citizens. Article 28 letter G regulated every person to have right to protect himself, family, honor, dignity, and was entitled to a sense of security and protection from the threat of fear.<sup>34</sup>

The implementation of these provisions was regulated in Act No. 39 of 1999 Article 69 paragraph (2) on Human Rights which regulated that each person's human rights caused basic obligations and responsibilities to respect the rights of others reciprocally, and it became the government's duty to respect, protect, uphold and promote it. Likewise, the government is obliged to guarantee the basic rights of the people relating to health services in the current situation of Covid-19.

Every patient of Covid-19 had rights to obtain privacy and medical confidentiality from the illness suffered including his medical records.<sup>35</sup> The regulation are as follows:

a. Act of Medical Practice, Article 48 paragraph (1) which regulates, "Every doctor or dentist in carrying out medical practice is obliged to keep the medical secrets"

b. Act of Health, Article 57 Paragraph (1), regulates, "Everyone has the right to the confidentiality

of his personal health condition stated by health service provider."

c. Act of Hospital, Article 44 paragraph (2), regulates, "Hospitals may refuse to disclose any information to the public relating to confidential medical records."

d. Article 73, Act of Health Workers which reads: "Every Health Worker in carrying out health services must keep the health confidentiality of the Health Service Recipients."

e. Act on Public Information Openness, Article 17 letter h number 2, which principally stipulates that every person has the right to their confidential personal health conditions that have been disclosed to the health service provider and each public organization must open access for public information applicant to obtain public information, except, one of them, regarding to person's history, condition and treatment, physical and psychological health treatment since if it is opened and given to public information applicants, the personal secret of patients can be revealed.

Based on the description above, from the Constitution to the Act, every person has rights in health services, especially related to their privacy in historical data of the illness. For this reason, doctors and hospitals are required to maintain the confidentiality of medical privacy of patients

### **Disclosure of Confidential Medical Record of Covid-19 Patients**

Once a state is in an abnormal condition or in an emergency situation, the state is allowed to take extraordinary actions including limiting human rights to maintain the integrity of the state and protect its citizens. If threat to citizens' safety exist, the state is considered to be able to act anything, regardless of the legality of the methods adopted. In other hand, acts of restriction on human rights, however, must have clear boundaries along with measures to minimize opportunities for abuse at the expense of broader humanitarian interests.<sup>36</sup>

Emergencies in health sector had been regulated in Act No. 4 of 1984 concerning the outbreak<sup>37</sup> This Act aimed to protect the population from the disasters caused by the outbreak as early as possible to improve the

ability of people to live healthy. Covid-19 pandemic is a form of non-natural disaster in the form of an outbreak, so the government must act immediately to protect the community.

Steps to follow-up the Government Plague Act issued Minister of Health Decree No. HK.01.07 / MENKES / 413/2020 concerning Guidance on Prevention and Control of Coronavirus Disease 2019 (Covid 19) in the explanation gives the understanding of covid 19 cases to be: Suspect Cases, Probable Cases, Confirmation Cases, Closer Contacts, Travel Actors, Discarded, Isolation Finished, and death.<sup>38</sup>

By the classification of Covid-19 patients, it is useful for doctors to provide services and medical measures to patients. To support the doctor's actions, a complete medical record must be supported. The contents of the medical record for Covid-19 must contain: a. patient identity; b. the condition when the patient arrives at a health care facility; c. identity of patients' guardian ; d. date and time; e. history taking results, including at least complaints and history of the disease; f. results of physical examination and medical support; g. diagnosis; h. treatment and / or action; i. a summary of the patient's condition before leaving the emergency services and a follow-up plan; j. names and signature of certain doctors, dentists or health workers who provide health services; k. transportation facilities used for patients to transfer to other health care facilities; l. other services provided to patients; m. the type of disaster and the location where the patient was found; n. emergency category and mass disaster patient number ; and o. the identity of person who found the patient. Meanwhile, according to Nasser<sup>39</sup> the medical record contained a series of information consisting of: a. information delivered by the patient to the doctor or hospital about matters related to what was felt and suffered as a disease; b. examination results or findings as well as the entire set of procedures for the illness suffered by a person including the treatment regime; c prognosis or future estimates of the disease and possible future health risks of the patient and d. patient identity if the disease poses a risk of stigmatization and discrimination in the long life ahead.

Disclosure the confidential medical records of Covid-19 patients cannot be categorized as acts that violate the provisions of Article 322 of the Criminal Code

paragraph (1) which reads: "... whoever intentionally discloses something secret, according to his position or occupation, both present and in the past, he obliged to save it, sentenced to prison for nine years maximum ... ". The provisions of Article 322 of the Criminal Code are confidential in general crimes

Arrangement of disclosure of patient's confidential medical records based on the principle of "lex specialis derogate generalis" has been regulated in several Acts and regulations including:

a. Act of Medical Practice, Article 48 Paragraph (2) which regulates: "Medical secrets can be opened only for the benefit of the patient's health, fulfill the request of law enforcement officials in the context of law enforcement, the patient's own request, or based on statutory provisions.

b. Act of Health, Article 57 paragraph (2) which regulates: "Provisions regarding the right to confidential conditions of personal health do not apply in the case of: a. law orders; b. court order; c. relevant permit; d. community interests; or e. the person's interests itself.

c. Act of Hospital, Article 44 paragraph (2) which regulates: "Medical secrets can only be opened for the benefit of the patient's health, to fulfill the request of law enforcement officials in the context of law enforcement, with the patient's own consent, or based on statutory provisions.

d. Act of Health Workers, Article 73 which reads: "The health secrets of health service recipients can be opened only for the benefit of the health service health recipients, fulfilling requests for law enforcement officials for the sake of law enforcement, requests for health service recipients themselves, or compliance with the provisions of the laws and regulations. "

e. Article 9 of The Minister of Health Regulation on Medical Secrets regulates: disclosure of confidential medical records based on the provisions of the legislation is carried out without the consent of the patient in the context of ethical or disciplinary interests, as well as the public interest.

From the provisions of existing legislation, the patient's confidential medical record can be disclosed when it deals with public / community interests. By

this disclosure, it will be easier for doctors to contact patient tracing with other parties which will increase the effectiveness and efficiency in the dissemination effort. The disclosure of the medical secrets of Covid-19 patients is not something embarrassing or has the potential to cause stigmatization or discrimination in the community but it will actually evoke community charity and solidarity. Conversely, if it is not, there will be a threat to the public interest of public health. Hiding the identity of Covid-19 patients will strengthen the spread of the virus in community.

Presidential Decree No. 11 of 2020 on the determination of emergency public health of Covid-19 regulates that efforts to prevent, handle and control, the government cannot work alone without involving community participation as well as victims, so it is a must to community to concern with data on people in monitoring (ODP), patients in oversight (PDP), and people at risk (ODR) / Travelers including groups of people without symptoms (OTG) to play an active role in avoiding, reporting and limiting the spread of Covid-19 in their region, both at the district / city, sub-district or at the village level even up to at the level of Rukun Tetangga (RT). Thus, disclosure the confidential medical records of patients in the era of Covid-19 Outbreak is not an unlawful act or an unlawful act by the authorities (onrechtmatige onverheidsaad).

While the disclosure of confidential medical records from the ethical side is also regulated in the Decree of the Medical Ethics Honorary Council No. 016 / PB / K.MKEK / 04/2020 on Medical Ethics Fatwa, Health Policy and Research in the Context of the Covid-19 Pandemic, has decided that the identity of patients or people with or without clinical symptoms with a positive diagnosis of Covid-19 (confirm case) in the principle must still be protected.<sup>40</sup> In certain circumstances, it can be limited to the initial name, gender, short health status (death / clinical severe crisis / recovery) age and chronology is limited to only those relevant to transmission, for example the spread of potential transmission locations with the intent of being a public alert and contact tracing (epidemiologic tracing). As for detailed clinical information, accompanying diseases and management should not be disclosed, exceptions can only be made in accordance with applicable laws and regulations, including relating to disclose the names

of public officials and the names of medical personnel and health workers as victims to be given awards by the world of the medical profession and country.

## Conclusions

The Act of Medical Practice, Act of Health, Act of Hospital, and Act of Health Workers stipulated that confidential medical records can be disclosed only for the benefit of the patient's health, fulfill the request of law enforcement officials in the context of law enforcement, the patient's own request, or based on the provisions of the legislation. In terms of medical ethics and discipline, the confidential record of Covid-19 patients may be disclosed in the initial name, gender and brief health status for public use. The public interest here means as the threat of extraordinary events or pandemics of infectious diseases threatening the safety of others both individually and in society.

## Limitation and Study Forward

This research is limited to the disclosure of confidential medical record of Covid-19 patients in time of current pandemic regarding to the statutory provisions and community interests. Since there are still other reasons to allow the disclosure of confidential medical records based on the court orders, so it is needed for further research to find the type of cases which are allowed to open the patient's medical record.

**Ethical Clearance :** Nil

**Conflict of Interest:** Nil

**Source of Funding:** Self Funding

**Acknowledgement :** Nil

## References

1. Putri. G.S. WHO Resmi Sebut Virus Corona Covid-19 sebagai Pandemi Global” Retrieved from <https://www.kompas.com/sains/read/2020/03/12/083129823/who-resmi-sebut-virus-corona-covid-19-sebagai-pandemi-global?page=all>. In accessed on 8 November 2020.
2. Kenyon. C. (2020). The serostatus approach to fighting COVID-19. *International Journal of Infectious Diseases*, 2020;94: 53–54.
3. Wibowo. A. Presiden Tetapkan COVID-19 Sebagai

- Bencana Nasional, Retrieved from <https://bnpb.go.id/berita/presiden-tetapkan-covid19-sebagai-bencana-nasional>. In accessed on 8 November 2020.
4. Nuraini. R. Kasus Covid-19 Pertama, Masyarakat Jangan Panik Retrieved from [Putrhttps://indonesia.go.id/narasi/indonesia-dalam-angka/ekonomi/kasus-covid-19-pertama-masyarakat-jangan-panik](https://indonesia.go.id/narasi/indonesia-dalam-angka/ekonomi/kasus-covid-19-pertama-masyarakat-jangan-panik). In accessed on 7 November 2020.
  5. Ihsanudin. Presiden Jokowi Teken Keppres Tetapkan Wabah Covid-19 Bencana Nasional Retrieved from <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2020/04/13/18101841/presiden-jokowi-teken-keppres-tetapkan-wabah-covid-19-bencana-nasional>. In accessed on 7 November 2020.
  6. Harjanto. S.A. Covid-19 Menyebar Hampir di Seluruh Kabupaten dan Kota di Indonesia Retrieved from <https://kabar24.bisnis.com/read/20200515/15/1241219/covid-19-menyebar-hampir-di-seluruh-kabupaten-dan-kota-di-indonesia>. In accessed on 7 November 2020.
  7. Rizky. F. 7 Provinsi Nihil Penambahan Kasus Positif Covid-19 pada 8 Juli 2020, Retrived from <https://nasional.okezone.com/read/2020/07/08/337/2243167/7-provinsi-nihil-penambahan-kasus-positif-covid-19-pada-8-juli>. In accessed on 7 November 2020.
  8. Sodiq. M. Y. Jerat Hukum Pembocor Hasil Tes Pasien Positif Covid-19 Retrieved from, <https://www.radarcirebon.com/2020/06/02/jerat-hukum-pembocor-hasil-tes-pasien-positif-covid-19/> In accessed on 5 November 2020.
  9. Machmud. S. *Penegakkan Hukum dan Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Dokter Yang Diduga Melakukan Medikal Malpraktek*. Bandung: Mandar Madju. 2008.
  10. Gunawan. *Memahami Etika Kedokteran*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius. 1991.
  11. Hamid.S. , Mir. M.Y., and Rohela.G.K., (2020). Novel coronavirus disease (COVID-19): a pandemic (epidemiology, pathogenesis and potential therapeutics. *New Microbes and New Infections*. 35: 1-10.
  12. Isfandyarie. Anny.. *Tanggung Jawab Hukum dan Sanksi Bagi Dokter Buku I*. Jakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.2006.
  13. Shereen. M.A., Khan. S., Abeer Kazmi. A., Bashir.N., Siddique.R., COVID-19 infection: Origin, transmission, and characteristics of human coron Nasser. M. (2020). Pembukaan Data Pasien yang Tertular Infeksi Covid-19. *Webinar Fakultas Hukum - Ikatan Alumni Magister Hukum Universitas Hang Tuah* aviruses. *Journal of Advanced Research*.2020; 24: 91–98. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jare.2020.03.005>.
  14. Sundoyo. Pembukaan Rahasia Pasien Versus Hak Privasi dalam Kasus Pandemi Covid-19. *Webinar Fakultas Hukum - Ikatan Alumni Magister Hukum Universitas Hang Tuah*.2020.
  15. Soekanto, S., and Mohammad, K. *Aspek Hukum dan Etika Kedokteran di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Grafiti Press. 1983.
  16. Wu. D., Wu.T., Qun Liu, Q., Yang, Y. The SARS-CoV-2 outbreak: What we know. *International Journal of Infectious Diseases*, 2020; 94: 44-48.
  17. Lumenta, B. *Pasien, Citra, Peran dan Perilaku: Tinjauan Fenomena Sosial*. Kanisius: Yogyakarta. 1989.
  18. Chazawi, H. *Malpraktek Kedokteran: Tinjauan Norma dan Doktrin Hukum*, Jakarta: Bayumedia.2007.
  19. Kuntardjo. C. *Prinsip Transparansi Dalam Informed Consent Tindakan Bedah: Untuk Mengurangi Risiko Sendiri*. Surabaya: Brilliant. 2017.
  20. Djamali, R Abdoel and Tejapermana, lenawati. *Tanggung Jawab Hukum Seorang Dokter dalam menaggani Pasien*. Jakarta: Abardin. 1998.
  21. Riyadi. M. *Hukum Kesehatan Kontemporer*. Akademika: Banjarmasin. 2017.
  22. Maclean, A. *Autonomy, Informed Condent and Medical Law: A Relational Challenge*. Cambridge: Chambridge University. 2009.
  23. Seran. M. and Styowati. A.M.W. *Dilema Etika dan Hukum Dalam Pelayanan Medis*. Bandung: Mandar Maju. 2010.
  24. Atmanti. H. D. and Naylah. M. The Efficiency of Health Care System in Indonesia, *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews*.2019. 7(6),44–651. <https://doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2019.7>.
  25. Mannas.Y.A. Hubungan Hukum Dokter dan Pasien Serta Tanggung Jawab Dokter Dalam Penyelenggaraan Pelayanan Kesehatan (Legal Relations Between Doctors and Patients and The Accountability of Doctors in Organizing Health Services), *Jurnal Cita Hukum (Indonesian Law Journal) FSH UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta*,2018; 6 (1): 163-182. <http://doi: 10.15408/>

- jch.v6i1.8274 163.
26. Ross.S.E.MD., and Lin,C.T. MD.(2013). The Effects of Promoting Patient Access to Medical Records: A Review. *Journal of the American Medical Informatics Association*. 10(2): 129-138. [http://doi: 10.1197/jamia.M1147](http://doi:10.1197/jamia.M1147)
  27. Sudjana. Aspek Hukum Rekam Medis atau Rekam Medis Elektronik sebagai Alat Bukti dalam Transaksi Terapeutik. *Veritas et Justitia* . 2017; 3 (2): 359-383. [http://doi: 10.25123/vej.2685](http://doi:10.25123/vej.2685).
  28. Sarsintorini. N.U.R., Putra., Kusumaningrum. A.E. Legal Protection That Justice the Filariasis Patient in Efforts to Prevent RooInfectious Diseases, *Advances in Economics, Business and Management Research*.2020; 140: 170-172.
  29. Adane. K, Gizachew. M., and Kendie, S.,. The role of medical data in efficient patient care delivery: a review. *Risk Manag Healthc Policy*. 2019. 12, 67–73.[http://doi: 10.2147/RMHP.S179259](http://doi:10.2147/RMHP.S179259).
  30. Rahmandiliyani, N., and Faizal. Kerahasiaan Rekam Medis di Rumah Sakit Aveciena Medika Martapura. *Jurnal Manajemen Informasi Kesehatan Indonesia*. 2018;.6 (2) : 69-78.[http://doi: 10.33560/.v6i2.189](http://doi:10.33560/.v6i2.189)
  31. Erlina and Tania. Analisa Sistem Pelepasan Informasi Rekam Medis di Rumah Sakit Imelda Pekerja Indonesia Medan. *Jurnal Ilmiah Perekam dan Informasi Kesehatan Imelda*. 2018; 3(1): 394-403.
  32. Rendarti. R. Faktor-Faktor yang Mempengaruhi Mutu Pelayanan Rakam Medis di Rumah Sakit. *Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Keperawatan dan Ilmu Kesehatan Masyarakat*. 209; 14(1): 59-60.
  33. Asrun. A.M. Hak Asasi Manusia dalam Kerangka Cita Negara Hukum (Catatan Perjuangan di Mahkamah Konstitusi). *Jurnal Cita Hukum*. Fakultas Syariah dan Hukum UIN Jakarta,2016; 4 (1). 133-154. [http://doi: 10.15408/jch.v4i1.3200.2016.4.1: 133-154](http://doi:10.15408/jch.v4i1.3200.2016.4.1:133-154).
  34. Haryanto,T., Suhardjana, J., Komari, A., and Wardaya, M.K. Pengaturan tentang Hak Asasi Manusia berdasarkan Undang-Undang Dasar 1945 Sebelum dan Setelah Amandemen. *Jurnal Dinamika Hukum*. 2018; 8 (2): 136-144.
  35. Adane. K, Gizachew. M., and Kendie, S., The role of medical data in efficient patient care delivery: a review. *Risk Manag Healthc Policy*. 2019; 12, 67–73.[http://doi: 10.2147/RMHP.S179259](http://doi:10.2147/RMHP.S179259)..
  36. Matompo.O.S., Pembatasan Terhadap Hak Asasi Manusia Dalam Perspektif Keadaan Darurat, *Jurnal Media Hukum*. 2014; 21(1): 57-72.
  37. Telaumbanua. D., Urgensi Pembentukan Aturan Terkait Pencegahan Covid-19 di Indonesia. *Qalamuna - Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, dan Agama*. 2020; 12 (1): .59-70.
  38. Widyawati. Kemenkes Kenalkan Istilah Probable, Suspect, Kontak Erat dan Terkonfirmasi COVID-19. Retrieved form <http://sehatnegeriku.kemkes.go.id/baca/rilis-media/20200714/2834469/kemenkes-kenalkan-istilah-probable-suspect-kontak-erat-dan-terkonfirmasi-covid-19/> In accessed on 8 November 2020.
  39. Nasser. M. Pembukaan Data Pasien yang Tertular Infeksi Covid-19. *Webinar Fakultas Hukum - Ikatan Alumni Magister Hukum Universitas Hang Tuah*.2020.
  40. Sutarno.Rahasia Medis Terbongkar di Publik Dimanakah hak Privasi Pasien Covid-19. *Webinar Fakultas Hukum - Ikatan Alumni Magister Hukum Universitas Hang Tuah*.2020.