

The Effect of Work Satisfaction on the Quality of Health Services (Literature Review)

Mutmainah Indriyati¹, Syahrizal Syarif²

¹Postgraduate Faculty of Public Health, University of Indonesia, ² Lecturer, Departement of Epidemiology of Public Health, University of Indonesia

Abstract

Introduction: Job satisfaction is a crucial factor that affects the productivity of human resources. While the health service organizations have the primary goal of providing the best quality health services for patients. Therefore, it is important to review the published articles about the effect of job satisfaction on health service organizations to understand how job satisfaction determines the quality of health services.

Method: This study is a literature review. Articles were collected from Proquest, Google Scholar, PUBMED, Emarldisight, and Science Direct and other relevant journal portals. Inclusion criteria in the selection of articles are 1) articles written in English or Indonesian, 2) articles are the research or systematic review relevant to the keywords, 3) articles were published in the year 2000 to 2019.

Result: Of the 16 articles reviewed, 15 studies prove that job satisfaction has a significant effect on patient satisfaction, performance, patient safety, quality of service, and the motivation to quit the job. On the other hand, one study shows that job satisfaction is not significantly related to patient satisfaction.

Conclusion: Employee job satisfaction is an important variable that must be considered by health service organizations to achieve competitive & high-quality performance in providing health services for the patients.

Keywords: *Job satisfaction, Health services, Quality.*

Introduction

Job satisfaction is defined as the degree to which people like or dislike their work(1). It is a crucial factor that affects the productivity of human resources. In any organization, human resources are considered as one of the most important assets that serve as an engine within the organization to provide a sustainable source of energy and service delivery⁽²⁾. There are several things

related to the importance of job satisfaction. First, that all people deserve to be treated fairly and with respect. Satisfaction is a reflection of good treatment, so it is considered as an indicator of emotional well-being or physiological health. Second, that job satisfaction can cause employee behavior that affects organizational functions. Furthermore, job satisfaction can be an indicator of the functioning of the organization⁽³⁾

The goal of a health service organization is to Providing a high quality of health services is required a committed and high-quality workforce. The presence of highly qualified and motivated staff is a key aspect of the healthsystemperformance. Many organizations recognize the importance of a potential relationship between job satisfaction and several expected organizational outputs, such as performance, absenteeism, staff turnover, and employee productivity⁽⁵⁾.

Corresponding Author:

Dr. Syahrizal MPH

Ph.D Faculty of Public Health, Jl.Lingkar Kampus

Raya Universitas Indonesia, Depok City,

Tel. (+62)21-7864975.

Fax (+62)21-7864975.

e-mail: mutmainahiindr@gmail.com

The quality of health services is associated with satisfaction, loyalty, and productivity and the profitability of the patients⁽⁶⁾. The quality and continuity of the relationship between the patient and the doctor affect the quality of the medical services provided. The quality of interaction between doctor and patient depends on the attitude and personality of the doctor towards empathy, compassion and honesty and technical expertise to gain the patients' trust⁽⁷⁾.

It is important for health service organizations to understand the relationship between job satisfaction and customer satisfaction and the overall customer experience⁽⁸⁾. Therefore, this literature review's aim is

to collect and analyze research articles about job satisfaction in health service organization employees to understand how job satisfaction can affect quality of health services. This analysis is done by compressing, collecting, and focusing on the impact of job satisfaction on the quality of health services, both directly and indirectly.

Method

Literature review were based on the Prisma method which consists of 5 stages. The first stage was the identification of articles based on inclusion and exclusion criteria. The inclusion criteria for selected articles were 2000 – 2019 publication time, focus on the effect or impact of job satisfaction. The exclusion categories are articles related to the keywords but not studying the case on health workers or health service organizations.

As for the search of secondary data, initial exploration was obtained in five publishers; Emeraldinsight, Proquest, Pubmed, Google Scholar, and Science Direct. The second stage was the screening by using specific keywords; job satisfaction, healthcare, and service quality. The total of literature found based on those keywords was 879 articles. Furthermore, the data was extracted using inclusion criteria, and 187 articles were obtained. Meanwhile, 102 articles were eliminated since they did not comply with the inclusion criteria.

The third stage was accessibility, of 60 articles that have been extracted (and 35 articles are eliminated), 25 articles were selected based on the titles and abstracts. These 25 articles were then extracted again by considering the inclusion category until 16 articles were determined to be reviewed. This is the included stage. Those 16 articles were then selected for further study. These are the articles:

1. Healthcare workers' satisfaction and patient satisfaction-where is the linkage? by Janicijevic I Et al. The Result is the effect of health care worker satisfaction on patient satisfaction has a relatively low level of significance⁽⁹⁾.
2. Interrelating employee satisfaction and customer satisfaction in the healthcare Industry Interrelating Employee Satisfaction & Customer Satisfaction in Healthcare Industry by Anand Shobhit Et al. The result is a high correlation between employees and customer satisfaction⁽¹⁰⁾
3. Effect of Job Satisfaction on the Turnover Intention of Employees in Indonesia by Pawesti Ristia. The result is job satisfaction has a significant and negative effect on the turnover intentions of the employee ⁽¹¹⁾
4. Job satisfaction and organizational commitment for nurses by Al-Aameri Ahmed S. The result is a strong and positive correlation between job satisfaction and organizational commitment. ⁽¹²⁾
5. Congruent Satisfaction: Is There Geographic Correlation Between Patient and Physician Satisfaction by Jennifer DeVoe et al. The result is the job satisfaction of doctors is strongly correlated with patient health satisfaction ⁽¹³⁾
6. The effects of health worker motivation and job satisfaction on turnover intention in Ghana: a cross-sectional study by Marc Bonenberger et al. The result is job satisfaction is significantly correlated to the motivation of the employee to quit the job ⁽¹⁴⁾
7. Is the job satisfaction of primary care team members associated with patient satisfaction? By Joachim Szecsenyi et al. The result is patient satisfaction is positively correlated with general job satisfaction from non-physicians but no significant correlation was found for doctors' job satisfaction and patients' satisfaction. ⁽¹⁵⁾
8. Impact of Job Satisfaction on Quality of Care Among Nurses on the Public Hospital of Lahore, Pakistan by Asima farman et al. The result is job satisfaction of the nurses and the quality of healthcare services are positively correlated⁽¹⁶⁾
9. Relationship Between Job Satisfaction Among Frontline Staff And Patient Satisfaction: Evidence From Community Health Centers In South Carolina by Ashley Lynn Barnes. The result is there is no significant relationship between patient satisfaction

and the job satisfaction of the Front Line Service (FLS) staff.⁽¹⁷⁾

10. Job Satisfaction of Nursing Staff and Patients' Perception of Quality care in a Tertiary Teaching Hospital, Odisha by Dharitri Swain. The result is patients' perceptions about the overall quality of healthcare are positively related to the job satisfaction of the nursing staff.⁽¹⁸⁾
11. A study of the relationship between job satisfaction, organizational commitment and turnover intention among hospital employees by Ali Mohammad Mosadeghrad et al. The result is employee job satisfaction and organizational commitment are closely interrelated and correlated with turnover intention.⁽¹⁹⁾
12. The Relationship Between Nurse Job Satisfaction and Patient Safety by Sherrie B. Lee. The result is a strong and positive correlation was found between nurse job satisfaction and patient safety.⁽²⁰⁾
13. Is the Professional Satisfaction of General Internists Associated with Patient Satisfaction? By Jennifer S Haas et al. The result is doctors whose job satisfaction levels are higher can support the satisfaction of the patients compared to patients of doctors whose job satisfaction levels are lower.⁽²¹⁾
14. The relation between job satisfaction and job performance in healthcare services by Ch. Platis et al. The result is a strong correlation between nurse job satisfaction with job performance.⁽²²⁾
15. The relationship between nurses' job satisfaction and inpatient satisfaction: An exploratory study in a Taiwan teaching hospital by Tzeng Huey Ming et al. The result is the job satisfaction of nurses is significantly correlated with the satisfaction of the inpatients⁽²³⁾
16. An investigation of job satisfaction, organizational commitment and role conflict and ambiguity in a sample of Chinese undergraduate nursing students by Wu, L et al. The result is a positive relationship between job satisfaction and organizational commitment, and a negative relationship between job satisfaction and role conflict and ambiguity.⁽²⁴⁾

Results

Seven of the 16 articles investigated the effect or relationship between job satisfaction and patient satisfaction in health care organizations. In general, it

has been proven that job satisfaction had a significant effect on job satisfaction with a correlation coefficient of 0.882⁽¹⁰⁾, 0.628⁽¹³⁾, 0.73⁽²¹⁾, 0.765⁽²³⁾. However, three of the seven articles stated an insignificant relationship between job satisfaction and patient satisfaction⁽¹⁷⁾ and also had a low level of significance⁽⁹⁾⁽¹⁵⁾.

In addition, three of the 16 articles examined the relationship between job satisfaction and employee commitment to the organization⁽¹²⁾⁽¹⁹⁾⁽²⁴⁾. Job satisfaction and organizational commitment were found to have a positive correlation. Correlation coefficients of 0.59⁽¹²⁾, 0.637⁽¹⁹⁾, and 0.464⁽²⁴⁾ showed a significant relationship between these 2 variables.

Three of the 16 articles examined the relationship between job satisfaction and the motivation to quit the job⁽¹¹⁾⁽¹⁴⁾⁽¹⁹⁾. Job satisfaction and the motivation to quit the job were found to have a negative correlation, with high levels of coefficient of -0.832⁽¹¹⁾ and 0.56⁽¹⁴⁾. On the other hand, a negative correlation was also found with a low correlation coefficient of 0.452⁽¹⁹⁾.

Furthermore, two of the 16 articles investigated the relationship between job satisfaction and health service quality⁽¹⁸⁾⁽¹⁶⁾. A positive and significant correlation was found, with a correlation coefficient of 0.612⁽¹⁶⁾ and 0.46⁽¹⁸⁾.

Finally, one study proved a positive and strong correlation between job satisfaction and patient safety with the correlation coefficient of 0.871⁽²⁰⁾. However, one other study proved a positive and significant correlation between job satisfaction with the productivity and performance of the employee, with a correlation coefficient of 0.76⁽²²⁾.

Discussion

The findings of this literature review emphasized that job satisfaction of the employees in health service organizations is indeed strongly related to patient satisfaction. The job satisfaction of nurses is significantly and positively correlated with the inpatient satisfaction with pain management, this is related to four indicators of satisfaction with hospitalization, namely the explanation of care, treatment method, pain management, and direction on how to continue the self-care at home and follow-up care⁽²³⁾.

One of the most influential aspects of patient satisfaction is the job satisfaction of the employee

with the time available to complete their works which affect the duration the patients spend with the doctor. It was explained that more satisfied doctors might be better able to answer patients' questions and problems. Doctors who are more satisfied with their professional lives can communicate better or empathize more with their patients⁽²¹⁾.

The most important job satisfaction factors affecting service quality are workload, staff scheduling, and work pressure. Work pressure is the factor that most determines the level of job satisfaction of nurses and the provision of quality care⁽¹⁶⁾. Desired outcomes also include attention to aspects of personal care, such as complaints and patient expectations, the patient's desire to be respected, and patient participation in decision making⁽²⁶⁾.

Job satisfaction also affects employee commitment to the organization that is characterized by three factors, including 1) acceptance of organizational values, 2) willingness to work hard on behalf of the organization, and 3) motivation to remain an employee of the organization⁽¹²⁾. The results of this study are consistent with other studies⁽¹⁹⁾, but in this study, organizational commitment is seen from 3 aspects; affective, sustainability, and normative commitment. Affective commitment is defined as a psychological bond with the organization, ongoing commitment as a cost associated with leaving the organization, and normative commitment as a perceived obligation to remain with the organization⁽¹⁹⁾. The organization will be strong if its staff shows commitment and dedication to the organization and acts for the benefit of the organization. When employees fail to carry out the tasks assigned voluntarily, the quality of the services provided by the organization will be under the expectation⁽⁴⁾.

Job satisfaction has also been proven to have a significant effect on the motivation to quit the job⁽¹¹⁾ ⁽¹⁴⁾⁽¹⁹⁾. The factors that most influence the employees' motivation to quit the job are low organizational commitment (especially affective commitment), lack of job satisfaction and dimensions (especially organizational policy), lack of job security and management, and supervision⁽¹⁹⁾.

Patient safety in this study was defined as a condition where patients were not disadvantaged by limited nursing resources, ineffective communication, or lack of administrative support. The elements of patient

safety reviewed are the area or work unit, supervision, communication, frequency of adverse events reporting and facilities⁽²⁰⁾.

Conclusion

In the service sector, especially in the health service organization, the service quality is strongly affected by the employees' behavior in serving the patients and deals directly with customers. Job satisfaction has a significant effect on the service quality of health service organizations, both directly and indirectly. The direct effect is related to customer satisfaction, patient safety, performance, and customer perceptions of the quality of service delivery. In addition, the indirect effect occurs in the association with organizational commitment, productivity, and the motivation to quit the job.

Ethical Permission: None

Source of Funding: Personal funds

Conflict of Interest: None

References

1. Spector Pe. Job Satisfaction: Application, Assessment, Cause, And Consequences. Sage Publication. 1997.
2. Mosadeghrad Am. Factors Influencing Healthcare Service Quality. *Int J Heal Policy Manag.* 2014;3(2):77–89.
3. Bhatnagar K, Srivastava K. Job Satisfaction In Health-Care Organizations. *Ind Psychiatry J.* 2012;21(1):75.
4. Zeithaml Va, Berry LI, Parasuraman A. The Behavioral Consequences Of Service Quality. *J Mark.* 1996;60(2):31–46.
5. Yee Rwy, Yeung Acl, Cheng Tce. The Impact Of Employee Satisfaction On Quality And Profitability In High-Contact Service Industries. *J Oper Manag.* 2008;26(5):651–68.
6. Mosadeghrad Am. Factors Affecting Medical Service Quality. *Iran J Public Health.* 2014;43(2):210–20.
7. Ditto Ph, Moore Ka, Hilton JI, Kalish Jr. Beliefs About Physicians: Their Role In Health Care Utilization, Satisfaction, And Compliance. *Basic Appl Soc Psych.* 1995;17(1–2):23–48.
8. Kirkman BI. Job Satisfaction And Job Performance: Is The Relationship Spurious? 2008.

9. Janicijevic I, Seke K, Djokovic A, Filipovic J. Healthcare Workers Satisfaction And Patient Satisfaction-Where Is The Linkage? [Internet]. Vol. 17, Hippokratia. 2013 [Cited 2019 Jan 31]. Available From: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3743622/pdf/Hippokratia-17-157.pdf>
10. Anand S, Dwivedi R. Interrelating Employee Satisfaction And Customer Satisfaction In The Healthcare Industry Interrelating Employee Satisfaction & Customer Satisfaction In Healthcare Industry. *Int Bull Manag Econ*. 2019;X(February).
11. Pawesti R, Rinandita W. Pengaruh Kepuasan Kerja Terhadap Intensi Turnover Karyawan Di Indonesia. *Ecopsy*. 2016;2(3).
12. Al-Aameri As. Job Satisfaction And Organizational Commitment. *Manag Res Rev*. 2016;39(12):1663–94.
13. Devoe J, Fryer Ge, Straub A, Mccann J, Care Sm, Jan N, Et Al. Congruent Satisfaction : Is There Geographic Correlation Between Patient And Physician Satisfaction ? Linked References Are Available On Jstor For This Article : Congruent Satisfaction : Is There Geographic Correlation Between Patient And Physician Satisf. *Med Care* [Internet]. 2007;45(1):88–94. Available From: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40221379>
14. Bonenberger M, Aikins M, Akweongo P, Wyss K. The Effects Of Health Worker Motivation And Job Satisfaction On Turnover Intention In Ghana: A Cross-Sectional Study. *Hum Resour Health*. 2014;12(1):1–12.
15. Szecsenyi J, Goetz K, Campbell S, Broge B, Reuschenbach B, Wensing M. Is The Job Satisfaction Of Primary Care Team Members Associated With Patient Satisfaction? *Bmj Qual Saf*. 2011;20(6):508–14.
16. Asima F, Robina K, Muhammad H, Ali W, Gillani Sa. Impact Of Job Satisfaction On Quality Of Care Among Nurses On The Public Hospital Of Lahore, Pakistan. *Saudi J Med Pharm Sci* [Internet]. 2017;3(6). Available From: <http://scholars.mepub.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/Sjumps-36a444-449.pdf>
17. Barnes Al. Relationship Between Job Satisfaction Among Frontline Staff And Patient Satisfaction : Evidence From Community Health Centers In South Carolina By Ashley Lynn Barnes Bachelor Of Science North Greenville University, 2002 Master Of Business Administration. University Of South Carolina; 2015.
18. Swain D. Job Satisfaction Of Nursing Staff And Patients 'Perception Of Quality Care In A Tertiary Teaching Hospital, Odisha. *Asian J Nurs Educ Res*. 2016;6(3):283.
19. Mosadeghrad Am, Ferlie E, Rosenberg D. A Study Of The Relationship Between Job Satisfaction, Organizational Commitment And Turnover Intention Among Hospital Employees. *Heal Serv Manag Res*. 2008;21(4):211–27.
20. Lee Sb. The Relationship Between Nurse Job Satisfaction And Patient Safety. University School Of Nursing; 2013.
21. Haas Js, Cook Ef, Puopolo Al, Burstin Hr, Cleary Pd, Brennan Ta. Is The Professional Satisfaction Of General Internists Associated With Patient Satisfaction? *J Gen Intern Med*. 2000;15(2):122–8.
22. Platis C, Reklitis P, Zimeras S. Relation Between Job Satisfaction And Job Performance In Healthcare Services. *Procedia - Soc Behav Sci* [Internet]. 2015;175:480–7. Available From: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.1226>
23. Tzeng Hm, Ketefian S. The Relationship Between Nurses' Job Satisfaction And Inpatient Satisfaction: An Exploratory Study In A Taiwan Teaching Hospital. *J Nurs Care Qual*. 2002;16(2):39–49.
24. Wu L, Norman Ij. An Investigation Of Job Satisfaction, Organizational Commitment And Role Conflict And Ambiguity In A Sample Of Chinese Undergraduate Nursing Students. *Nurse Educ Today* [Internet]. 2006 May;26(4):304–14. Available From: <https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0260691705001917>
25. Lohr Kn, Wehling Jh. Medicare: A Strategy For Quality Assurance, I: A Recapitulation Of The Study And Definition Of Quality Of Care. 1991.
26. Baker A. Book: Crossing The Quality Chasm: A New Health System For The 21st Century. *Bmj*. 2001;